

Problem #11099 Proposed by Matthias Beck (Max-Planck Institute, Bonn), Richard Ehrenborg (University of Kentucky), and Thomas Zaslavsky (Binghamton University of SUNY). A 3×3 square array of nine distinct integers is called *semimagic* if all the row and column sums are equal, and it is *magic* if in addition the two diagonals have the same sum as the rows and columns. Let's make out of the square a set of three 3-sided dice, as follows: the sides of die i are labelled with the numbers in row i . We say die i *beats* die j if we expect die i to show a bigger number than die j more than half the time.

- (a) Suppose the square is a magic square whose entries are $1, 2, \dots, 9$. Prove that no die beats the other two and no die loses to the other two. Every die beats one die and loses to the other die.
- (b) Show the same is true if the entries are any distinct integers that form a magic square.
- (c) Suppose the square is a semimagic square whose entries are $1, 2, \dots, 9$. Show the same conclusion holds as in (a) and (b).
- (d) But, there are semimagic squares for which one die beats both other dice.
- (e) * What happens with larger magic and semimagic squares?